

APPROVED
Bd. Mtg. 4-18-13

BOARD OF EDUCATION
(Official)

March 27, 2013
Elizabeth, New Jersey

A public hearing on the 2013-2014 Board of Education Proposed Budget was called on March 27, 2013 at 7:00 p.m., in the Multi Purpose Room, Donald Stewart Center for Early Childhood Education, 544 Pennsylvania Avenue, Elizabeth, New Jersey.

Board President Tony Monteiro presented the following statement at 7:45 p.m.

“Ladies and Gentlemen, good evening. This is a special meeting of the Board of Education pursuant to New Jersey Statutes and the rules adopted by the Board of Education, notice of this meeting was published in the Worrall Community Newspapers, Luso Americano, and Noticiero Columbian on Thursday, March 21, 2013. In addition, this notice is posted on the Bulletin Board in the lobby of 500 North Broad Street, and pursuant to this act, a copy has been filed with the City Clerk of Elizabeth.

I wish to extend a warm welcome to everyone present for this March 27, 2013 meeting of the Board of Education. This meeting is being recorded and will become part of the Elizabeth Board of Education permanent record. In order that the recording will adequately reflect the proceedings, please refrain from talking while others are speaking. I also ask that you silence the sound on your electronic devices. Since it is legally mandated that these proceedings be accurately recorded, I may have to ask for order periodically should noise begin to interfere with our recording capabilities. I am pleased that you have taken time this evening to join us. Thank you for your interest in the Elizabeth Public Schools.

We are here this evening to hear the public express their views regarding the proposed 2013-2014 budget, in accordance with New Jersey Statute 18A:22-13, and I quote, ‘On the date and at the time and place so fixed, the Board of School Estimate or the Board of Education as the case may be shall hold such public hearing at which time the taxpayers and other interested persons shall have an opportunity to present objections and to be heard with respect to said budget and the amounts of money necessary to be appropriated and the various items and purposes for which the same are to be appropriated for the use of public schools in the district for the ensuing school year.’

Those wishing to speak for or against the budget must sign in one hour prior to the advertised start of the meeting so that they may have the opportunity to speak. The sign-in sheet states the name, address, and telephone number of the person wishing to speak.”

Present: Ms. Bathelus, Mrs. Castillo-Ospina, Messrs. Donoso, González, Padlo, Perreira, Trujillo, Monteiro – 8

Absent: Mr. Nazco – 1

Superintendent of Schools Pablo Muñoz, School Business Administrator/Board Secretary Harold E. Kennedy, Jr., Board Attorney Kirk Nelson, Assistant Superintendent for Schools Jennifer Barrett, Assistant Superintendent for Family and Community Outreach Jerome Dunn, Assistant Board Secretary Donald Gonçalves, Comptroller Dr. William Greene and members of the public were in attendance.

Dr. Greene gave the invocation.
Pledge of Allegiance

Pledge of Ethics
Core Beliefs and Commitments

Mr. Monteiro introduced Superintendent of Schools Pablo Muñoz to present the 2013-2014 Budget.

Mr. Muñoz thanked Board President Monteiro and welcomed everyone to the presentation of the 2013-2014 school budget of the Elizabeth Board of Education. Mr. Muñoz stated that our Elizabeth Board of Education is for all the community, all over Elizabeth, working hard to achieve excellence, we're moving forward by supporting and enhancing the programs that continue to make us the Number One Urban School District in the State of New Jersey.

Mr. Muñoz stated our vision that the Elizabeth Public Schools will be one of the best school systems in America and in a few short years we will change our vision to become one of the best school systems in the world. Mr. Muñoz stated our mission on a daily basis is to provide excellent educational experiences and services to inspire every student to think, to learn, to achieve, and to care. Mr. Muñoz stated that the Board's core beliefs and commitments are structured in a way that go from students to teachers to leaders and to a high performing team.

Mr. Muñoz stated that we're moving forward by following our 3L's, our guiding principles, love, laser-like focus on teaching and learning, and leadership. Mr. Muñoz stated that love is a driving force for all that we do, it is the foundation of our Pledge of Ethics, and we have to love what we do, every second, of every minute, of every hour, of every day, of every week, of every month, of every year. Mr. Muñoz stated that the reason we are here must revolve around the love of the school district we work for and the education we provide to every student, in every classroom, every day. Mr. Muñoz stated that we need a laser-like focus on teaching and learning that helps us increase student achievement, eliminates the achievement gap, and prepares students for post-secondary education and high-paying employment. Mr. Muñoz quoted John Maxwell, "Everything rises and falls on leadership" and stated that as an organization, the phrase "no excuses...just excellent results" is part of our district's culture. Mr. Muñoz stated that for us to realize our vision of becoming one of the best school systems in America there will be moments when we will be challenged and we need to ask ourselves whether we will find reasons to succeed or reasons to fail. Mr. Muñoz stated that leadership is about taking a stand and never being fearful about what we are doing when we know it is right for our students.

Mr. Muñoz stated that this year's presentation will be in four parts, our financials, our drivers, our programs and services, and our accomplishments. Mr. Muñoz stated the first part of the budget presentation is finances and the 2013-2014 revenue will total \$500,810,339. Mr. Muñoz stated that the vast majority of that amount will come from the New Jersey State Aid, \$417,116,887. which is 83.4% of our revenue. Mr. Muñoz stated that the next largest source of our revenue will come from the local Elizabeth taxpayer, \$52,313,124. which is 10.4% of our budget, federal aid is \$15,083,636. which is 3.0%, balance appropriation is \$15,668,723. which is 3.1%, and miscellaneous revenue is \$627,969. which is 0.1%. Mr. Muñoz stated that additional aid for the new school year has been reported and the New Jersey Department of Education has provided aid figures for districts all over the State of New Jersey and Elizabeth has received the largest increase. Mr. Muñoz stated that our total state aid for 2013-2014 will be \$417,116,887. and the State of New Jersey has provided \$7.5 million increase over last year. Mr. Muñoz stated that the next closest school district that received a high amount of State Aid was about \$4 million behind us.

Mr. Muñoz stated that the local tax levy which is about 10% of our revenue is about \$52 million for the next school year. Mr. Muñoz explained a chart showing where your tax dollars go and stated that if you live in Elizabeth and get taxed, the tax gets collected and that money goes to three government agencies locally. Mr. Muñoz stated that you pay for your City of Elizabeth government which is run by the Mayor and City Council and provides fire and police and other

services and that tax burden on the Elizabeth taxpayer is about 60% of your tax bill. Mr. Muñoz stated that the next portion of the tax bill that accounts for 24% is for the Elizabeth Public Schools. Mr. Muñoz stated that the Union County Freeholders and its government, the County of Union, accounts for 16% of your overall tax bill for the year.

Mr. Muñoz stated that comparing the City of Elizabeth tax levy to the Elizabeth Board of Education over a 16 year period from 1997 to 2012 there has been a change in the amount of taxes collected by the City and the Board of Education which contribute to their budgets. Mr. Muñoz stated that in 1997 both the City of Elizabeth and the Board of Education were taxing the Elizabeth taxpayers about \$38 million and were pretty equivalent. Mr. Muñoz stated that in 2012 the City of Elizabeth is taxing the local taxpayer \$123 million and the Board of Education is taxing the local taxpayer at about \$48 million. Mr. Muñoz presented the information in a bar graph and stated that over time the Elizabeth Board of Education has pretty much stayed flat and during the period from 1999 through 2003 the Board of Education actually decreased every year the taxes on the local taxpayer. Mr. Muñoz stated that between 2005 and 2007 there was no change in the local tax levy and no increase to the local taxpayer and in 2007, 2008, and 2009, there was an increase in the local levy ordered by the State of New Jersey to raise the levy and we had no choice. Mr. Muñoz stated that in 2010, 2011, and 2012 when the choice was given back to the Board of Education they did not increase the tax levy and kept it at a 0% change.

Mr. Muñoz stated that except for one year the City of Elizabeth has steadily increased their budget over the last sixteen year period. Mr. Muñoz stated that the City of Elizabeth tax levy increased by \$85 million during the period from 1997 to 2012 while the Board of Education tax levy increased by \$10 million during the same period. Mr. Muñoz stated that the difference over time between the City of Elizabeth and the Board of Education in 2012 is \$75 million. Mr. Muñoz stated that a historical summary over the last sixteen years shows the City of Elizabeth increased their tax levy amount by \$85 million as compared to the Board of Education which increased only \$10 million over the same period. Mr. Muñoz stated that the percentage increase in the tax levy resulted in a 218% increase for the City of Elizabeth and only 27% increase for the Board of Education. Mr. Muñoz stated that over the 16 year period the annualized effective rate for the City of Elizabeth is 14.5% tax increase per year and over the same period the annualized effective rate for the Board of Education is 1.8% per year.

Mr. Muñoz stated that the 2013-2014 total budget is about \$500 million dollars and the largest expenditure is for instruction for our students and special programs totaling \$394 million which accounts for about 79% of the school district's budget. Mr. Muñoz stated that the next largest category is the operation and maintenance of our plant including our facilities, our schools, and our fields and the support services for that which is 9% of our budget or about \$45 million. Mr. Muñoz stated the next largest category is other which is 8.7% of our budget or about \$43 million and includes employee benefits, transportation, and capital improvements to our school facilities. Mr. Muñoz stated that a very proud position for the Elizabeth Board of Education is that the Board of Education has zero Debt Service in their tax levy which means they have not asked for additional funds from the City to pay down debt. Mr. Muñoz stated that the last category is about 3% for administration which is about \$16 million.

Mr. Muñoz stated that the 2013-2014 comparative per pupil cost is \$17,444. per student including \$10,704. for classroom instruction, \$78. for equipment costs, community services, and special schools, \$2,396. for cleaning, repair and maintenance of our schools, our plant, and property, \$176. for athletics and extracurricular activities, \$2,620. for support services including health, guidance, child study teams, library, and professional development, and \$1,470. for administration. Mr. Muñoz stated that he would like to highlight this particular part of the 2013-2014 budget that shows we have significantly increased the amount of money that our schools will have next year and that we have increased our schools' budgets by almost \$17 million. Mr. Muñoz explained a chart showing the per pupil cost in different categories comparing last year's budget to the budget for 2013-2014 and stated that the Elizabeth Board of Education is following

their vision statement because they are increasing the cost of classroom instruction from last year's budget to this year's budget by \$559. per student, and the extracurricular activities such as athletics and clubs by an additional \$21. per student. Mr. Muñoz stated that at the same time the Board of Education made hard decisions and decreased portions of the budget including support services, administration, legal, operations and maintenance, and equipment. Mr. Muñoz stated that this district is mindful that we want to run an efficient school system with minimum central administration budget so this next year's budget shows a decrease in the amount of money spent on central administration by about \$2 million. Mr. Muñoz stated that the Elizabeth Public Schools spend less on administrative costs and benefits when compared to the State of New Jersey regional cost. Mr. Muñoz stated that the State of New Jersey Regional cost per student is \$1,848. and here in Elizabeth the cost for administration is \$1,470 per student. Mr. Muñoz stated that we are wise with our dollars and invest in our schools and the students' programs and we try to minimize the expenditures on administration salaries and benefits. Mr. Muñoz stated that he is happy to report that earlier this year our independent auditor gave us an unqualified independent auditors' opinion which is the highest opinion on the Comprehensive Annual Financial Report (CAFR) for the year ended June 30, 2012.

Mr. Muñoz stated that the second part of the presentation will focus on the drivers which are increasing in the budget or are new things that were not in the budget last year and drive the expenditures. Mr. Muñoz stated that we're moving forward and building our budget responsibly and basing it on principles included within our Keys to Excellence 2 Strategic Plan. Mr. Muñoz stated that the Elizabeth Board of Education built this budget based on our strategic plan that lays out our vision statement, our mission, our core beliefs, our guiding principles, and our strategies. Mr. Muñoz stated that we built our budget based on the fact that we have a core commitment number one which is equivalent to our hedgehog concept of preparing all of our students to graduate prepared to pursue a post-secondary education. Mr. Muñoz stated that when we built our budget we were very mindful that our enrollment has been increasing pretty steadily over the last four years and in this school year we now have a little over 24,000 students in our schools here in Elizabeth. Mr. Muñoz stated that we also contract with early childhood providers and some other out of district placements and when you add all the students for whom we are responsible we have about 25,000 students in our school district. Mr. Muñoz stated that the enrollment of Elizabeth High School had its highest point in the mid-2000s and then we saw a steady decline but this past year we saw an incredible jump and in our six high schools we have over 5,200 students.

Mr. Padlo excused himself from the meeting at 9:05 p.m.

Mr. Muñoz stated that a driver of this budget which is new that did not exist before is that we will be opening a new School No. 8, our venture into a concept we call iPrep Academy for K-8 students with one-to-one student to technology device at the school along with a special math program for grades 5-8 using special math software and algorithms to target students individually. Mr. Muñoz stated that the new cost to our budget is \$5.8 million including 37 new teachers. Mr. Muñoz stated that next year we will also be opening a new neighborhood School No. 21 increasing our budget from last year by \$1.5 million including 14 new teachers. Mr. Muñoz stated that we have seen a nice growth in enrollment across the district PreK-12 and we will be adding 12 new high school teachers next year at a cost of \$1 million and 43 new K-8 teachers at a cost of \$3.6 million. Mr. Muñoz stated that our salaries overall from last year to this year increased by \$9.8 million, benefit costs increased by \$4.7 million and our special education costs increased by \$3.8 million. Mr. Muñoz stated that we invest in our schools, our students and our teachers and next year's budget will have \$16.8 million more than this school year.

Mr. Muñoz stated that the next part of the budget presentation is our programs and services that will tie back to our expenditures. Mr. Muñoz stated that this year will be different

than other years and that in the past the budgets were presented using the five priorities and 3L's. Mr. Muñoz stated that this year the budget will be presented using five different categories including maintaining our school system, raising standards and expanding opportunities, building professionalism, protecting our investments (capital and maintenance projects) and planning for the future. Mr. Muñoz stated that these five categories were given to us by the New Jersey Department of Education asking us to build our budget around these particular categories and to provide information as to how we were meeting these particular category goals. Mr. Muñoz stated that he is presenting the information as it was given to the New Jersey Department of Education.

Mr. Muñoz stated that the first category maintaining our school system includes adding new instructional and non-instructional staff for 2 new schools, new staff for expansion of our Bilingual Magnet program, and new staff for K-12 to address the increase in enrollment. Mr. Muñoz stated that we will continue the extended day and extended year programs, refurbishing our Language Arts Literacy Writing Notebooks K-8, Foss/STC science materials K-8, continuing with our music and arts programs, world languages 8-12, Spanish, Portuguese, and Latin 9-12, extensive list of electives and exploration programs, continuing our Visual Arts Center Partnership, revising many of our curricula in subject areas, guidance, interventions, and library services. Mr. Muñoz stated that we will be providing safe and caring initiatives with alternative programs for at-risk learners, mentoring programs at middle and high schools, Check & Connect Program, physical education supplies, weight room equipment, musical instruments, contracted psychiatric services, contracted nursing services, nursing supplies and equipment, and sign language interpreter services. Mr. Muñoz stated that our home and school relationships provide for communication materials and brochures designed to promote school and district programs, student and parent handbooks, newsletters, district website, operation of video channel, PowerSchool, Learning Management System, iLeap Next Gen (blackboard), high school registration in the evening and summer, student and parent college preparation and financial aid seminars, and attendance liaisons. Mr. Muñoz stated that our academic safety nets provide resources for summer programs including Promotion/Retention Program K-8, Contagious Curiosity Program, summer remediation and advanced credit 9-12, Ready, Set, Explore Program, and Writers Workshop Program. Mr. Muñoz stated that our afterschool and Saturday remediation and enrichment programs include After School Academic Program K-8, After School Visual and Performing Arts Program K-8, Saturday Intensification K-8, After School/Saturday SAT Prep Program, Contagious Curiosity Saturday Program, and Saturday Recreation Program (special education). Mr. Muñoz stated that our academic interventions include Advancement Via Individual Determination (AVID) K-12 and our programs for special education include SOLO Adaptive Technical System K-8, Carnegie Learning Summer Academic Program K-8, Literacy Intervention Summer School K-8, Moving with Math Intervention Summer Program K-8, Wilson Program K-8, Vizzle Program K-8, IEP Direct Program K-12, 504 Related Services, Extended School Year Program K-12 (special education), contracted speech services, contracted occupational therapy/physical therapy, applied behavioral analysis (ABA) services and the Bilingual Magnet 3-8 program for bilingual education students. Mr. Muñoz stated that home instruction includes hospital home instruction and after school home instruction. Mr. Muñoz stated that we provide transportation services to support academic needs for all special needs students and students that live outside of a specified area. Mr. Muñoz stated that we are maintaining athletic and co-curricular activities for programs in 6-12 including Sports Clinics, Athletic Summer Camps, Middle School Intramural Sports Program, and the High School Athletic Program. Mr. Muñoz stated that we provide resources for the student assessments including NJASK, HSPA, ACCESS, DRA2, TerraNova, SUPERA, NJPASS, PSAT, SAT, PreIPT, MAC II, and APA. Mr. Muñoz stated that we provide technology resources for classroom support including providing students in grades 6-12 with individual email addresses, Microsoft Ecosystem, Science TWIG films 4-8, renewal of the E-Suite Deluxe software license

for Everyday Mathematics K-6, maintenance of the equipment for the TV studio 9-12 and computer-based training for teachers and students to obtain technology certification. Mr. Muñoz stated that we will provide resources to upgrade the infrastructure for K-12 and expansion of tablet computers for K-12. Mr. Muñoz stated that we will provide resources to increase internal bandwidth capacity for the Partnership for Assessment of Readiness for College and Careers (PARCC) which is a consortium of 22 states plus the U.S. Virgin Islands working together to develop a common set of K-12 assessments in English and Math anchored in what it takes to be ready for college and careers and PARCC will use technology throughout the design and implementation of the assessment system. Mr. Muñoz stated that we provide district technology resources for our financial systems, human resources system, payroll system, accounts payable system, budgeting system, maintenance of our transportation software system, automated telephone messaging system, upgrade of two-way radio network to a digital network, telephone system upgrade for K-12, and video conferencing K-12.

Mr. Muñoz stated that the second category is raising standards and expanding opportunities and includes career and college readiness providing for International Baccalaureate PreK-8 which aims to develop inquiring, knowledgeable and caring young people who help to create a better and more peaceful world through intercultural understanding and respect and the programs encourage students across the world to become active, compassionate and lifelong learners who understand that other people, with their differences, can also be right. Mr. Muñoz stated that the International Baccalaureate continuum of international education is unique because of its academic and personal rigor, challenging students to excel in their studies and in their personal growth. Mr. Muñoz stated that the International Baccalaureate (IB) Program will be at Dr. Orlando Edreira Academy School No. 26 including the IB Primary Program for students aged 3-12 and will focus on the development of the whole child as an inquirer both in the classroom and in the world outside and the IB Middle Years Program for students aged 11 to 16 provides a framework of academic challenge that encourages students to embrace and understand the connections between traditional subjects and the real world and become critical and reflective thinkers. Mr. Muñoz stated that at Thomas Jefferson Arts Academy the IB Diploma Program for students aged 16 to 19 is an academically challenging and balanced program with final examinations that prepare students for success at university and beyond.

Mr. Muñoz stated that we will provide resources for Naviance for College and Career Readiness 9-12, New Jersey Institute of Technology (NJIT) Program 9-12, and Fairleigh Dickinson University Middle College Program (MCP) for dual enrollment earning college credit for grades 9-12. Mr. Muñoz stated that we will provide visual and performing arts enrichment including continuing our partnership with the Visual Arts Center for grades 9-12, and expanding our partnerships with the Metropolitan Opera Guild Learning Network K-8, continuing with the Teen Arts Program and Summer Arts Institute for Students. Mr. Muñoz stated that we will provide resources to close the achievement gap including the Language Acquisition Summer Program, we will be sending students in the summer to the University of New Mexico Leadership Conference for Students, expanding our Bilingual Libraries K-8, continue with the popular Rutgers University Business Youth (RUBY) Program 9-12, and we will continue our programs and partnership with the National Academy Foundation. Mr. Muñoz stated that currently we have the Academy of Finance at Admiral William F. Halsey, Jr. Leadership Academy, Academy of Information Technology and the Academy of Engineering at John E. Dwyer Technology Academy, and we will be exploring a new National Foundation Academy at Thomas A. Edison Career and Technical Academy which has to do with health services. Mr. Muñoz stated that we will be including a Verbal Behavior Network and providing our special education students with needed supplies. Mr. Muñoz stated that we will update the K-12 library and media programs with e-books for grades K-12, we will continue to offer our students field trips for our students to museums, playhouses, and colleges and our early childhood students explore a lot of the community restaurants, stores, supermarkets to understand community and life living. Mr.

Muñoz stated that we are reviewing and revising the ESL offerings at the high school level and are changing our curriculum and how we teach the program. Mr. Muñoz stated that we were selected for a pilot program and now we are in the second year to bring into the school system a new evaluation tool and we are using the Danielson Framework for Teaching. Mr. Muñoz stated that we are now also required to adopt a new evaluation instrument for our principals and vice principals and the Board has already done so adopting the Marzano School Leadership Evaluation Model.

Mr. Muñoz stated that the next category is building professionalism and we will be providing training in a lot of different areas with the focus on literacy, language, and English including Reading Street On-Site Coaching, Literacy and Interventions On-Site Coaching, two week Summer Institute for Teaching and Learning where we offer multiple professional development opportunities for our teachers to take courses in the summer and we offer the same and some other unique offerings during the Fall, Winter and Spring. Mr. Muñoz stated that we will provide mathematics training including Everyday Mathematics On-Site Coaching, and Lens on Learning On-Site Coaching, resources for social and emotional development include Rutgers Natural Therapeutics Management System On-Site Coaching for Special Education K-8, data resources include resource disks for student data and analytics, new teacher training include New Teacher Network Induction Programs and Montclair State University Network for Educational Renewal, professional networking on best practices and new pedagogies include Welcome Back Materials, Panasonic Foundation, AVID and International Baccalaureate. Mr. Muñoz stated that we will continue with the EE4NJ Educator Evaluation Effectiveness including Teacher and Leader Evaluation Professional Development and Teacher Evaluation Manual Development. Mr. Muñoz stated that we will provide Harassment, Intimidation, and Bullying (HIB) programs including Suicide Prevention Training for school psychologists and nurses and Bullying Prevention. Mr. Muñoz stated that we will provide professional development including differentiated instruction, personalized learning environments, and alternative proficiencies and diabetes training for nurses.

Mr. Muñoz stated that the next category is protecting our investments, capital and maintenance projects, and we will provide for building and infrastructure improvements including sidewalks, roof, ventilation systems, boiler repairs and floor repairs, installation of a swipe card system and cameras to improve safety and security, improvement of security systems at various schools, improvement to athletic facilities including bleachers, flooring, and gym equipment and improvement of access for handicapped students and adults with the installation of elevators. Mr. Muñoz explained a chart with the breakdown of the cost of each of the improvements and stated that the total for the building improvements scheduled to be made in the schools of Elizabeth is over \$5 million and we continue to reinvest in our buildings.

Mr. Muñoz stated that the last category for programs and services is planning for the future and we are providing resources for the acquisition and rehabilitation of a former private school building for public school use K-8, preparation for the opening of a brand new school facility PreK-8 and property improvements that help increase classroom count.

Mr. Muñoz stated that the final area of the budget presentation is our accomplishments. Mr. Muñoz quoted Paul Tractenberg, Star Ledger March 2012, "Every school district should seek to emulate Elizabeth's record of accomplishment, improvement and recognition. For a district overwhelmingly populated by poor minority students, it is an extraordinary achievement." Mr. Muñoz stated that we're moving forward with an Elizabeth Public Schools' successful uniform policy and over 24,000 students wear uniforms in the Elizabeth Public Schools and we are proud to announce that our new schools for 2013-2014 will have uniforms. Mr. Muñoz stated that the Elizabeth Public Schools has a record of building and acquiring facilities to improve education including Frances C. Smith Center for Early Childhood Education School No. 50, Donald Stewart Center for Early Childhood Education School No. 51, Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. Center for Early Childhood Education School No. 52, Dr. Orlando Edreira Academy School No. 26, Dr.

Antonia Pantoja School No. 27, Juan Pablo Duarte-José Julián Martí School No. 28, Dr. Albert Einstein Academy School No. 29, Ronald Reagan Academy School No. 30, Msgr. João S. Antão School No. 31, acquisition of Holy Rosary (Charles J. Hudson School No. 25), acquisition of St. Catherine's (Alexander Hamilton Preparatory Academy Annex), acquisition of St. Adalbert's (George Washington School No. 1 Annex), acquisition of St. Hedwig's (Mabel G. Holmes School No. 5 Annex), acquisition of Blessed Sacrament (Madison-Monroe School No. 16 Annex), and acquisition of St. Vladimir's (EHS). Mr. Muñoz stated that in the works is the acquisition of St. Patrick's (new iPrep School No. 8 which is under construction), Victor Mravlag School No. 21 which is under construction, and Frank J. Cicarell Academic High School which is under construction. Mr. Muñoz stated that Governor Chris Christie just announced construction of a new William F. Halloran School No. 22 as the next large scale school project to be introduced for Elizabeth as part of the list of recommendations for twenty new capital school construction projects statewide. Mr. Muñoz stated that in our work with the State of New Jersey the Elizabeth Public Schools has built the most new schools of any city in the State of New Jersey.

Mr. Muñoz stated that among our accomplishments we are transforming our libraries into digital learning centers and the libraries at the John E. Dwyer Technology Academy, Elmora School No. 12, and the Thomas A. Edison Career and Technical Academy are now iLeap Centers with the latest in technology and multimedia for our students to engage in academic and social collaboration during and after school hours. Mr. Muñoz stated that the iLeap Center at the John E. Dwyer Technology Academy was dedicated to the memory of community leader Catherine Saintilien. Mr. Muñoz stated that the new Williams Field was unveiled with new turf and a new scoreboard, new turf field at Dr. Orlando Edreira Academy School No. 26, and the naming of the Robert J. Delaney Warehouse Building. Mr. Muñoz stated that we're moving forward with our school district sign program, we are improving the conditions for learning including installation of air conditioning throughout Abraham Lincoln School No. 14 and in common space assembly areas in 9 schools, we built an addition to Mabel G. Holmes School No. 5 cafeteria and expanded the play area, we constructed a dance studio and renovated adjacent locker rooms in Terence C. Reilly School No. 7, renovated the courtyard playground at George Washington School No. 1 to improve safety and optimization of the space, remodeled and redesigned the cafeterias at both Admiral William F. Halsey, Jr. Leadership Academy and John E. Dwyer Technology Academy. Mr. Muñoz stated that our long term plan to improve our facilities has included creating an Elizabeth Public Schools paint standard and 16 schools have been painted so far creating an environment more conducive to learning while reinforcing our brand identity. Mr. Muñoz stated that we continue to make large scale improvements to the infrastructure of our schools and gave an example of the work at Thomas A. Edison Career and Technical Academy including the flooring of the shops, auditorium, gym, as well as a complete renovation of the Cosmetology Lab. Mr. Muñoz stated that the High Schools Welcome Center continues to provide members of our community with a one-stop location where you can receive any information and register for any of our six high schools. Mr. Muñoz stated that we are on the leading edge of technology and EPStv allows you to watch live streaming of Elizabeth Public School instruction, events, and community meetings and as a district we continue to leverage the strength of social media to broadcast information to a larger audience allowing our district to be a leader in long distance learning and to pioneer digital learning on a larger scale. Mr. Muñoz stated that the Elizabeth Public Schools has made an investment in our wireless and digital transmission capabilities so that we are at the leading edge of digital technology and instruction. Mr. Muñoz stated that last year the first Elizabeth Public Schools Excellence Parade was held to provide students and team members recognition for their excellence throughout the year and the participation of those in the school community as well as those in the community at large helps to portray the district in a positive light. Mr. Muñoz stated that the Elizabeth Public Schools OneFest was held, the 5th Annual Teen Health Expo which is the largest teen obesity awareness event in the U.S. was held

at Dunn Sports Center, and Healthy Leap is a cooperative effort with the business community and the Gateway Chamber of Commerce. Mr. Muñoz stated that the Alliance for a Healthier Generation awarded the Elizabeth Public Schools with 7 bronze, 12 silver, and one gold award and out of 15,000 schools nationally there are only two schools in the whole country that have been awarded Gold Medal Status with the Healthier Generation founded by the American Heart Association and the William J. Clinton Foundation and one of those nationally ranked schools is Terence C. Reilly School No. 7. Mr. Muñoz stated that among our accomplishments of parades, exhibits and cultural events our Board of Education continues to participate and support many cultural and international efforts including Colombia, Cuba, El Salvador, Portugal, Cape Verde and Angola, Africa. Mr. Muñoz stated that the Elizabeth Board of Education joined our State Troopers and Supervisors/Principals Union for the second year in a row to give warm coats to Elizabeth Public School students who were in need of one and thanks to the collaborative effort the New Jersey State Troopers helped to distribute over 250 coats to needy students. Mr. Muñoz stated that our Elizabeth Board of Education distributed toys to children during the holidays and the Board of Education set up drop off locations at several facilities to collect for the Sandy Relief Effort providing clothing, food, and supplies to those negatively impacted by the hurricane. Mr. Muñoz stated that we rewarded team member excellence with Keys to Excellence plaques, keys, and pins to excellent teachers throughout the district. Mr. Muñoz stated that town hall meetings provide access to all the community and are scheduled for locations all over the City of Elizabeth providing an opportunity for everyone in the community to discuss current and new initiatives of the Elizabeth Public Schools as we continue on our path to becoming the best school system in America. Mr. Muñoz stated that over 2 million breakfasts were served to students, we provided all students with well-balanced lunches serving over 3 million and we applied for the Fresh Fruit and Vegetable Program grants for all K-8 grades and were awarded 16 grants. Mr. Muñoz stated that teaching and learning in the Elizabeth Public Schools continues to be enhanced significantly through the use of technology and we have implemented over 4,000 iPads throughout the district in addition to expanding the number of laptops that have been placed in all of our K-12 schools. Mr. Muñoz stated that SMART and STAR boards are white boards that connect and interact with computer technology and can be found in over 80% of our schools including our early childhood centers to provide students with innovative lessons in all subject areas. Mr. Muñoz stated that we are moving forward with a large scale implementation of laptop carts throughout every school in 2013-2014. Mr. Muñoz stated that we have provided educational field trips for students from throughout the district to places like Liberty Science Center, New Jersey State House, Washington, D.C., United Nations, American Museum of Natural History, Metropolitan Museum of Art, Meadowlands Environmental Center, and colleges and universities in the region providing our students with experiences that last a lifetime.

Mr. Muñoz stated that the Elizabeth High School Cheerleaders participated in a Disney televised holiday parade, the Winter Athletics for 2011-2012 included NJSIAA Group 4, North Jersey, Section 2 Boys Basketball State Champions, the Star Ledger ranked the Elizabeth High School Boys Basketball #13 in the Star Ledger Top 20, #3 in Group 4, and #2 in Union County and the Star Ledger All Union County Boys Basketball named Hakeem Rogers 1st Team and Isaiah Davis 2nd Team, the Star Ledger All Junior Boys Basketball State named Hakeem Rogers 1st Team, the Star Ledger All Junior Boys Basketball Union County named Hakeem Rogers and Isaiah Davis and the Star Ledger All Union Boys Basketball Coach of the Year selected Elizabeth Public Schools Coach Chris Balent. Mr. Muñoz stated that the Star Ledger All Union County Wrestling named D'Ondre Floyd 1st Team 138 lbs., James Thevenin 3rd Team 113 lbs., and Mateo Perez 3rd Team 138 lbs., and the Union County Wrestling Tournament Outstanding Wrestling Award named D'Ondre Floyd, the Star Ledger All Union County Boys Winter Track and Field named Elijah Hughes 3rd Team, 55 meters, and the Star Ledger All Union County Girls Winter Track and Field named Caterina Rodriguez 3rd Team, 3,200 meters. Mr. Muñoz stated that for the Spring 2012 the Star Ledger All union County Baseball named Martin Tavares 1st

Team, the Star Ledger All Group 4 Baseball named Martin Tavares 3rd Team, the Star Ledger All Union County Softball named Savannah Riotte 1st Team and Nicole Mendoza 3rd Team, the Star Ledger All State Boys Spring Track and Field named Shane King 3rd Team for Long Jump, the Star Ledger All Union County Boys Spring Track and Field named Shane King 2nd Team for Long Jump, Phillip Walker 2nd Team for Javelin, Elijah Hughes 3rd Team for 100 meters, and Kyle Ward 3rd Team for Long Jump, the Star Ledger All Union County Girls Spring Track and Field named Tamoya Brown 2nd Team for Intermediate Hurdles and Kim Bourgouin 3rd Team for Discus, the Star Ledger Boys Tennis Union County Player of the Year is Jorge Rodriguez Del Rey, the Star Ledger Boys Tennis Union County Tournament First Singles Champion is Jorge Rodriguez Del Rey and the Star Ledger All Union Boys Tennis named Jorge Rodriguez Del Rey 1st Team. Mr. Muñoz stated that for the Fall 2012, the NJSIAA GROUP 5, North Jersey Section 2 Football State Champions are the Elizabeth High School Football Team, the ranking for the Elizabeth High School Football Team is #1 in NJN News 12 Top 20, #1 in NJ in Gridiron Magazine, #2 in the Star Ledger Top 20 (#1 public school district), and #1 in Union County, the Star Ledger Union County Football Team of the Year is Elizabeth High School, the Star Ledger State Offensive Player of the Year is Phillip Walker, the Maxwell Football Club MiniMax High School Award selected Phillip Walker, the Star Ledger All State Football named Phillip Walker 1st Team Offense, Kason Campbell 2nd Team Offense and Jahad Thomas 2nd Team Defense, the Star Ledger All Group 5 Football named Phillip Walker 1st Team Offense, Kason Campbell 1st Team Offense, Akram March-Williams 2nd Team offense, Jahad Thomas 1st Team Defense and Ezekiel Villafana 2nd Team Defense, the Star Ledger All Union County Football named Phillip Walker 1st Team Offense, Kason Campbell 1st Team Offense, Akram March-Williams 1st Team Offense, Kyle Ward 2nd Team Offense, Akeem Polk 2nd Team Offense, Victor Tate 3rd Team Offense, Jahad Thomas 1st Team Defense, Ezekiel Villafana 1st Team Defense, Jabriel McRae 2nd Team Defense, and Hasim Pretlow 3rd Team Defense. Mr. Muñoz stated that for the Fall 2012 the Star Ledger named Elizabeth High School Boys Soccer # 3 in Union County, the Star Ledger All Union County Boys Soccer named David Zorrilla 2nd Tem and Emmanuel Olayinka 3rd Team, the Star Ledger All Union County Girls Soccer named Tamoya Brown 3rd Team, the Star Ledger All Union County Boys Cross Country Track named Bryant Cordova 1st Team, the Star Ledger Union County Boys Cross Country Track Newcomer of the Year named Bryant Cordova, the Star Ledger Union County Girls Cross Country Track named Esthre Jean-Louis 1st Team and the Star Ledger All union County Girls Volleyball named Alexis Booker 3rd Team. Mr. Muñoz stated that Elizabeth High School Football Coach John Quinn was named the New Jersey Coaches Association State Coach of the Year and that Coach Quinn led Elizabeth to an 11-0 season, the North Jersey Section 2, Group 5 title and a #2 finish in the Star Ledger Top 20 this past season. Mr. Muñoz stated that the Elizabeth High School Band has won multiple State and National Championships making our Marching Band one of the best high school bands in the nation.

Mr. Muñoz stated that achievement is up and we are committed to increasing achievement in 2013-2014. Mr. Muñoz stated that we are the No. 1 Urban School District in New Jersey. Mr. Muñoz stated that we are achieving our goals and have met or exceeded the Annual Measurable Objectives (AMO) Targets in Language Arts in several schools including grades 3-8 School Nos. 1, 3, 7, 13, 14, 18, 21, 22, 26, and 28; grade 11 in Elizabeth High School, Thomas A. Edison Career and Technical Academy, Admiral William F. Halsey, Jr. Leadership Academy, Alexander Hamilton Preparatory Academy, and Thomas Jefferson Arts Academy. Mr. Muñoz stated that we have met or exceeded the Annual Measurable Objectives (AMO) Targets in Mathematics in several schools including grades 3-8 Schools No. 1, 4, 6, 7, 12, 13, 14, 16, 18, 19, 21, 22, 23, 25, 26, 28, 29, and 30; and grade 11 at Elizabeth High School, John E. Dwyer Technical Academy, Alexander Hamilton Preparatory Academy, and Thomas Jefferson Arts Academy. Mr. Muñoz stated that we reached or exceeded QSAC Targets in Science in several schools at several grade levels and the elementary grade 4 and middle grade 8 target is 70%. Mr. Muñoz stated that the elementary grade 4 target was met or exceeded at School Nos. 1, 2, 3, 4, 5,

6, 7, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 18, 19, 21, 22, 23, 25, 26, 27, 28, 29, and 30 and the middle grade 8 target was met or exceeded at School Nos. 7, 14, 15, 16, 18, 21, 22, 26, 27, 29, and 30. Mr. Muñoz explained a comparison chart showing Algebra I enrollment by grade level for Elizabeth, Newark, Irvington, and Millburn and stated that Elizabeth is one of the very few school districts that has 100% of students taking Algebra I in grades 7 or 8. Mr. Muñoz explained a chart comparing Algebra I enrollment by grade level for many Union County districts including Berkeley Heights, Cranford, Hillside, Linden, Mountainside, Plainfield, Rahway, Scotch Plains, Union, and Westfield and stated that again Elizabeth is one of the very few districts that has 100% of students taking Algebra I in grades 7 or 8. Mr. Muñoz explained a chart comparing Algebra I enrollment by grade level for many of the former Abbott Districts including Asbury, Camden, East Orange, Harrison, Irvington, Jersey City, Long Branch, Neptune, New Brunswick, Newark, Orange, Passaic, Paterson, Perth Amboy, Phillipsburg, Plainfield, Trenton, Union City, West New York, and Elizabeth. Mr. Muñoz stated that once again Elizabeth is in the forefront of having 100% of students in grades 7 or 8 take Algebra I and many of our peer communities are at much lower numbers than us. Mr. Muñoz stated that in December we presented our performance over time between the baseline year and this past school year 2012 and that in just about every grade in language arts and math and every grade in science achievement is up. Mr. Muñoz stated that the Elizabeth Board of Education made a very bold move in 2009 and that for many years here in the City of Elizabeth starting in the late 1970's we had one high school. Mr. Muñoz stated that in the 2009-2010 school year the Elizabeth Board of Education redesigned its high school and created six independent high schools with their own academic or career themes and since their establishment each school is getting better in language arts literacy and mathematics. Mr. Muñoz stated that last year was our highest year over the last ten years and 80% of students in eleventh grade who took the HSPA test for the first time were proficient in language arts literacy and that last year was also our highest year over the last ten years for mathematics. Mr. Muñoz stated that we have been very aggressive in this district wanting more students enrolled in high academically rigorous courses like Advanced Placement (AP) and when this administration and Board took over after the 2005-2006 school year when we started to change policy and our students had access to more advanced classes. Mr. Muñoz stated that last school year we had over 1,400 students enrolled in rigorous Advanced Placement courses as compared to 171 in 2000-2001. Mr. Muñoz stated that because more students take the classes more students take the AP Exam test and in 2000-2001 only 120 tests were taken and last year 1,355 AP Exam tests were taken and the number of students earning 3 or higher on the AP Exams increased to 366 last year making them eligible for college credit. Mr. Muñoz stated that the maximum SAT score used to be 1600 and now the maximum score is 2400 because they have added a writing section and that our score has been pretty steady around 1200 and last year we increased it to 1246. Mr. Muñoz stated that 2012 was our best year for perfect scores and there were 331 which is an increase 2,650% over 2005. Mr. Muñoz stated that over 2,500 people were present at the Perfect Score Rally. Mr. Muñoz stated that we are achieving our goals and the increase in our student achievement continues to make our budgetary investments not only worthwhile for our students but for the taxpayer of Elizabeth as well.

Mr. Muñoz stated that recently were received an announcement by the New Jersey Department of Education about the Reward Schools for 2013 and they acknowledged 57 Reward Schools across New Jersey indicating overall high performance and/or marked progress on statewide exams. Mr. Muñoz stated that presently there are only six schools in all of Union County and two of them are located in Elizabeth, Terence C. Reilly School No. 7 and William F. Halloran School No. 22. Mr. Muñoz stated that Reward Schools are listed annually, identifying those schools that for the 2011-2012 state test either showed high achievement levels overall or the greatest progress as indicated by the state's new system of "student growth percentiles" (SGP). Mr. Muñoz stated that last year there were 112 and this year is half of last year's total largely due to the fact that schools are now required to meet specific academic achievement

targets. Mr. Muñoz stated that we have gone through the Middle States Accreditation process at our high schools and have achieved Middle States Accreditation at Elizabeth High School and Thomas A. Edison Career and Technical Academy. Mr. Muñoz stated that there are three additional high schools which have gone through the accreditation process in 2012-2013 including Alexander Hamilton Preparatory Academy, Thomas Jefferson Arts Academy, and John E. Dwyer Technology Academy and have not officially received their accreditation but at its exit statement the visiting team indicated that Alexander Hamilton Preparatory Academy, Thomas Jefferson Arts Academy and John E. Dwyer Technology Academy will be accredited. Mr. Muñoz stated that leaves one more accreditation visit for Admiral William F. Halsey, Jr. Leadership Academy which will occur in late April and May. Mr. Muñoz stated that we are proud to announce that Alexander Hamilton Preparatory Academy is one of the best high schools in America as declared by U.S. News and World Report by receiving a silver medal and Elizabeth High School is one of the best high schools in America as declared by U.S. News and World Report by receiving a gold medal. Mr. Muñoz stated that Newsweek announced the best high schools in the nation and Elizabeth High School was selected in the Newsweek ranking as one of the top 1,000 high schools in America. Mr. Muñoz stated that Newsweek compared the quality of education among the nation's top secondary schools in the following categories including four-year on time graduation rate, percentage of 2011 graduates accepted to college, AP/IB/AICE tests per student, average SAT and/or ACT score, average AP/IB/AICE exam score, and AP/IB/AICE courses offered per student. Mr. Muñoz stated that many people make decisions on where they want to live based on the high school that their children will attend and by comparison Elizabeth High School out of 1,000 in America is ranked No. 217 nationally and is better than New Providence, Summit, Livingston, Madison, Cranford, Westfield, Clark, and Morristown. Mr. Muñoz stated that Elizabeth High School and Alexander Hamilton Preparatory Academy are nationally recognized by the Washington Post with Elizabeth High School receiving recognition for the second year in a row and the first time for Alexander Hamilton Preparatory Academy. Mr. Muñoz stated that Elizabeth High School was ranked No. 2 in New Jersey and No. 77 in America and Alexander Hamilton Preparatory Academy also received state and national ranking. Mr. Muñoz stated that we are very proud that we have three National Blue Ribbon Schools indicating that we have three of the best elementary schools in America and since 2005 is the most of any city in the State of New Jersey.

Mr. Muñoz stated that the Board of Education and central office administration believe in an open and transparent budget process, all Board of Education meetings are open to the public, and agendas and meeting minutes are available at www.epsnj.org. Mr. Muñoz stated that copies of the tentative 2013-2014 budget are on file at the Board of Education Mitchell Building and a copy of the proposed budget is posted online at the district's website www.epsnj.org. Mr. Muñoz stated that the Elizabeth Public Schools achieve excellence and our dedicated team members continue to do an outstanding job at managing our time and energy, effectively administering all our responsibilities, going above and beyond for the sole objective of realizing our vision and we have as a community risen up to the challenge and have proven our children can truly achieve excellence. Mr. Muñoz stated that we could not have accomplished so much without the commitment and leadership of our Board of Education and the support of the community-at-large.

Mr. Muñoz stated that we were very proud recently when a number of our third grade students from Terence C. Reilly School No. 7 were asked to appear on the Dr. Oz Show with First Lady Michelle Obama who was launching her new program, Let's Move, a comprehensive initiative dedicated to solving the challenges of childhood obesity in our generation. Mr. Muñoz stated that the Let's Move initiative is in partnership with the Alliance for a Healthier Generation and when it was time to choose a school that was healthy and could do a very nice job on the show with the First Lady, our students were selected and made us proud by appearing on national television where millions of people saw them perform. Mr. Muñoz introduced a video of the Terence C. Reilly School No. 7 students performing with First Lady Michelle Obama and Dr. Oz.

Mr. Muñoz stated that our Elizabeth Board of Education for all the community, all over Elizabeth is working hard to achieve excellence for our children.

Mr. Monteiro thanked Mr. Muñoz for the very thorough and informative presentation.

Resolution – School Budget for the 2013-2014 School Year

A motion was made by Mr. Trujillo, seconded by Mr. Donoso, that the resolution be adopted.

Mr. Trujillo thanked the administration and especially Superintendent Pablo Muñoz for a great presentation who is always very thorough and always prepared to highlight the good things going on in the district. Mr. Trujillo stated that it has been a very tough year. Mr. Trujillo stated that we are spending more on education and that such a large portion goes into the classroom is very important. Mr. Trujillo stated that we have been able to create a very successful academic environment for our children and the educational system provides a lot of jobs and opportunities to the local community and that we are one of the largest employers in the area and we are able to maintain those jobs which is very important especially in these economic times. Mr. Trujillo stated that investment in our children's education cost a lot of money and as the detailed graphs show over the years as we have seen he is very proud to say that when we look at the responsibility of spending this money and allocating the funds especially when it comes to the tax levy and the responsibility and the burden we put on the local taxpayer. Mr. Trujillo stated that when we hear of so many people losing their houses and not being able to afford it, having come from the mortgage finance he understands how taxes play a role when people decide where to invest and buy homes and they ask two questions, how great are the schools, and what are the taxes. Mr. Trujillo stated that often people may or may not qualify for those reasons. Mr. Trujillo stated that we have been very responsible over the last few years and the Superintendent's presentation went back over sixteen years and the one that stands out is the chart that compares the Board of Education tax levy with the City of Elizabeth tax levy. Mr. Trujillo stated that the Board of Education tax levy line is very steady and is the line of fiscal responsibility and responsibility not only to our children but to the taxpayers. Mr. Trujillo stated that it is very important that people understand that this is not easy and he remembers in 2010 when we had a shortfall and we were underfunded for so many years and had to lay off people. Mr. Trujillo stated that was very difficult because when you lay off people you not only affect the lives of the people that work in our school system but also the children that they come in contact with every day and you have to make hard decisions on where and how you are going to affect these children. Mr. Trujillo stated that through fiscal responsibility and good stewardship of the taxpayers' money we were able to hire people back. Mr. Trujillo stated that all the success that the district has had has come with very little change to the tax levy. Mr. Trujillo stated that if we were to collect the levy that would put us on par with what the State wants us to collect it would be so high that we would probably see what happened in Buffalo at one time where so many people moved out that the schools were empty because the economic pressure on the city was incredible. Mr. Trujillo stated that he wished we would see the same responsibility at the City level and to see the chart with the red line of the tax levy of the City is unsustainable. Mr. Trujillo stated that when you look at our budget and our pie chart and the way it is divided the amount of money it cost for administration and the percentage for a district is minimal. Mr. Trujillo stated that so much money is going into the classroom. Mr. Trujillo stated that when you compare that to the City budget they are top heavy at the administration level with increased salaries so much so that the City Councilmembers recently voted themselves a raise and the taxpayers are paying for that. Mr. Trujillo stated that the comparison chart of the tax levy of the Board of Education compared to the City Government tax levy always put it in perspective for him, that when you see the gap between the City Government tax levy and the Board of

Education tax levy, that is you not being able to make a living, choosing between putting food on the table and paying your taxes, and you getting lost in there. Mr. Trujillo stated that the values are going to be based on what they give you for the City Government tax levy on how much you pay them for their services and the quality of education that you get for the Board of Education and that is very important. Mr. Trujillo stated that he remembers being under the pressure of the mandated increases of the tax levy and despite wanting to hold the line on taxes we were forced for several years to go to the taxpayers and increase taxes due to the infinite wisdom of the Corzine administration. Mr. Trujillo stated that once the Christie administration took over we now have the 2% cap and despite this for the last two years we held the tax levy at 0% increase. Mr. Trujillo stated that the City took advantage of it, raised taxes and spent the money. Mr. Trujillo stated that they don't like you to see the chart that compares the Board of Education tax levy with the City of Elizabeth tax levy because this is not a good chart for them. Mr. Trujillo stated that he proposed we send them a copy of this chart just to remind every City Councilmember that there has to be a responsibility when you are dealing with the taxpayers' money. Mr. Trujillo stated that we have been very fortunate under the Christie administration, in total contrast of what happened during the Corzine years, to be rewarded not only with the breaking ground of a new high school but they have moved forward a lot faster on the construction of Victor Mravlag School No. 21 and have held the construction contractors to a higher standard to make sure they are moving forward with it. Mr. Trujillo stated that they have also allowed us to expand our early childhood education with more funding and this year we are very fortunate that the additional aid given to us is more than \$4 million more than the next highest recipient. Mr. Trujillo stated that this will allow us to continue to operate our district and provide the level of excellent education opportunities to the citizens of Elizabeth that they not only deserve but have become accustomed to and that he can finally hear people moving back to the City of Elizabeth which he has not heard in a long time. Mr. Trujillo stated that having people move back to the City of Elizabeth was a personal goal of his because it broke his heart for so many years to see so many good people choose between giving their children a good education and moving somewhere else. Mr. Trujillo stated that Elizabeth is being recognized for all the good things that are happening and we are doing it all while keeping costs in check. Mr. Trujillo stated that this is the perfect example that leadership counts and when you have the right group of people leading a district that really care about what they're doing for their citizens they spend the money wisely. Mr. Trujillo stated that this is your money and this is the taxpayers' money and is an investment not only from the City of Elizabeth but we get a large part from the State. Mr. Trujillo stated that taxpayers all throughout the State invest in us and we have a responsibility to our State taxpayers to do the right thing. Mr. Trujillo stated that we have and we will continue to do that. Mr. Trujillo stated that he will support budgets like this as long as they are fiscally prudent and responsible and we can continue to give the taxpayers and the children in Elizabeth what they deserve when it comes to education.

Ms. Bathelus thanked Superintendent Muñoz for the PowerPoint presentation on the budget and stated that she had a few questions. Ms. Bathelus stated that the Governor gave us an additional \$7 million to the budget and asked if it was added in.

Mr. Muñoz explained that it is in the total state aid revenue.

Ms. Bathelus asked about the total revenue from state sources and what the differences are between the line items of \$48 million and \$365 million from state aid.

Mr. Muñoz stated that \$365 million and the \$48 million which is primarily PreSchool Education Aid are both included in state aid revenue.

Ms. Bathelus stated that on the next page it says total revenue from state sources but is a different number.

Mr. Muñoz explained that the total from state sources was primarily preschool aid and other state aid includes transportation aid, extraordinary aid, special education, equalization categories. Mr. Muñoz stated that number is the total operating budget and explained what is included in the number.

Ms. Bathelus stated that she did notice that there is going to be an increase from last year of approximately \$4 million meaning that we are going to increase the taxes on the taxpayer by about \$200. to 300. per household and asked if that is correct.

Mr. Muñoz stated that the local levy is increasing from \$48.6 million to \$52 million and the per household is not the number you gave, that is what the mayor was tweeting but his numbers are a little off. Mr. Muñoz asked Mr. Kennedy for the correct amount.

Mr. Kennedy responded that the number is \$139.98.

Mr. Muñoz stated that it is about \$140. per average household for the year.

Ms. Bathelus asked if this budget is concrete or can we still make changes to it or are there no changes that we can make to it.

Mr. Muñoz stated that there is a motion and a second. Mr. Muñoz stated that the Board is taking discussion and the President will decide if he is going to have a roll call or not.

Ms. Bathelus stated that lastly she noticed throughout the presentation and through some conversation that there are references to the City of Elizabeth's budget versus the Board of Education's budget. Ms. Bathelus stated that she hopes moving forward that one day the Board of Education and the City of Elizabeth can unite in what they are doing in the City so that it is not us versus them and it is us working together to move forward for our children.

Mr. Trujillo stated that he is a taxpayer and has two children in the City of Elizabeth Public Schools. Mr. Trujillo stated that for less than 40 cents per day which is the average increase to the taxpayers of Elizabeth, we are keeping the level of education and heading in the direction we are. Mr. Trujillo stated that he can't wonder where someone would not be willing to pay about 38 cents per day more to educate their children in our schools. Mr. Trujillo responded to the comment made by Ms. Bathelus in reference to us working with the City and stated that he has been on this Board of Education since 2007 and on the record has extended many invitations to City Council and the Mayor to work with this Board and he has not yet to receive one phone call to one invitation to even have dialogue. Mr. Trujillo stated that in 2007 there was a shooting down the street from his house and a thirteen year old boy lost his life to gang violence and the following day a gentlemen, a construction worker, went to answer the door thinking it was his ride at 5:00 a.m. and got shot in the neck by the same guy who shot the little boy the night before. Mr. Trujillo stated that the third day after that while chasing a drug dealer who ran into his yard the police unloaded a 9mm on a fifteen year old dog while his family was in the house. Mr. Trujillo stated that in November of that year he saw the Mayor at a grand opening of a business in town and when he went to shake his hand the Mayor rebuked him and slapped it away because he made comments on the record in 2007 when a New York Times reporter who asked him as a newly elected member of this Board what he thought of what was happening in this neighborhood and he said we have a gang problem. Mr. Trujillo stated that the Mayor of this City sits in City

Hall and still denies that there is a gang problem even after that same individual who shot the man and that child was convicted of being a gang member. Mr. Trujillo stated that City Council refuses to protect our children and admit that there is a gang problem in our City. Mr. Trujillo stated that he has tried to work with City and they refused to work with him and this Board. Mr. Trujillo stated that his colleagues who have served here throughout the years since he has been on this Board know that they have refused to work with us. Mr. Trujillo stated that he has an obligation as a Board member to point out their fiscal irresponsibilities with our tax dollars and so he points to that chart and in that sense it is us versus them. Mr. Trujillo stated that we are being fiscally responsible, we are protecting our children and doing everything possible and they are playing politics with the children and their safety. Mr. Trujillo stated that not once has any one of them come here to attend our Board meetings. Mr. Trujillo stated that he was at the City Council last night, he wasn't going to make any comments and was just going to sit there and listen and he couldn't help but notice and you could actually feel the fear of the group that was there who wanted to discuss incidents and a shooting that were happening at Oakwood Plaza. Mr. Trujillo stated that they were afraid to express their concerns with how the police department was treating them and City Council was prepared for a riot and had a big police presence there. Mr. Trujillo stated that here are these citizens concerned how their government is treating them and they wanted to express themselves and they are afraid of the same police that are there to protect them. Mr. Trujillo stated that the City Council President went on a rant for a minute and a half before he opened public speaking to remind everyone that if they were disrespectful or he didn't like what they said he would rebuke them the first time and the second time the police would remove them. Mr. Trujillo stated that the first lady that spoke was shaken and forgot what she went there to say and only when he called them out did everyone go up and say their piece of mind and said what they were there to say. Mr. Trujillo stated that you can't be afraid to talk about our government, this is still America and we are encouraged to talk about our government. Mr. Trujillo stated that as an elected official he has the right and the responsibility to point out fiscal mismanagement whether it be here or at City Hall or at state government and he has that responsibility. Mr. Trujillo stated that everyone does and whether you choose to exercise it and that he respects you and will not judge you. Mr. Trujillo stated that he cannot sit here quiet while City Hall continues to tax him and practically wants to tax him out of town and would be happy not to have people like him live here and much rather have this whole place empty. Mr. Trujillo stated that they are displacing thousands of families at Oakwood Plaza and not offering any counseling or any help and are just displacing them. Mr. Trujillo stated that imagine being a child living in those projects watching half of the projects boarded up and others destroyed to rubble and you look out your window and there is police presence that looks like a prison. Mr. Trujillo stated that he has called for meetings after meetings after meetings and they have no interest in working with this Board of Education. Mr. Trujillo stated that they do not use our schools and their children are allowed to go to private schools which he respects but that would be great if they weren't doing it with taxpayer dollars because we pay their salaries and they use that money to pay to have their children go somewhere else to another school. Mr. Trujillo stated that he sends his children here and he is very proud to send them here.

Ms. Bathelus commented that she doesn't mean to go back and forth and Mr. Trujillo seems to be very upset over maybe a comment that she made. Ms. Bathelus stated that moving forward it's a new day, it's a new time so she still has hopes that one day we still can work together. Ms. Bathelus stated that she knows that he tried numbers of times and hopes that one day they will be able to work with us.

Mr. Monteiro thanked Ms. Bathelus for the olive branch between what we are trying to do to unite our City and our Board of Education and would be in the right direction. Mr. Monteiro stated that we feel the passion and we can understand the anger of Mr. Trujillo. Mr.

Monteiro stated that bringing the two together is like two elephants in the room and when they fight only the grass gets hurt and in this case it is our students in our district and the taxpayers in the City. Mr. Monteiro stated that we could achieve and accomplish so much more if that was possible but just this very morning we had the Mayor of the City sending out his social media saying lies about him and the budget that we are presenting tonight. Mr. Monteiro stated that without having presented the budget in public the Mayor is using social media to distort and mislead and to put fear into the people of Elizabeth. Mr. Monteiro stated that it is important that we are using the forums like we are using here tonight in a public hearing to educate and inform all the citizens in Elizabeth about what is going on here in the Board of Education and what is going on at City Hall. Mr. Monteiro stated that there are some very stark contrasts as Mr. Trujillo pointed out, that in the weeks and in the months ahead that what the Mayor put out will lead to more lies and more distortions to throw people off that we've raised taxes. Mr. Monteiro stated that the fact remains that what Mr. Trujillo pointed out on this chart is very simple and easy to understand. Mr. Monteiro stated that Superintendent Muñoz did a wonderful budget presentation for all at home to hear all the wonderful things that are happening here and also pointed out the stark differences between what is going on here and what is happening at City Hall. Mr. Monteiro stated that the number on the chart showing what the City has raised for taxes in the last twelve years is an obscene number. Mr. Monteiro stated that the Mayor put out on social media that he is offended that we are raising taxes when we look like we almost have a flat line over the last twelve years. Mr. Monteiro stated that to stay within the parameters of what the Governor has set is a testament to the hard work of the Superintendent and his administration who work long and hard in putting this budget together, that it was not easy, it was difficult and certainly there was a lot of pain in putting this budget together. Mr. Monteiro stated that we are proud of this budget and certainly we are not happy that we have to raise taxes and it is the furthest thing from their minds and we know we fought this long and hard but what this school district has done and provided to the residents of the City of Elizabeth is beyond remarkable. Mr. Monteiro stated that we have three National Blue Ribbon schools, the No. 2 High School in the State of New Jersey, our population growth of students is exploding, where once people were leaving the City to go to the suburbs of Linden, Hillside and Roselle and now the reverse is happening with people moving back to Elizabeth because they want to be a part of our school system. Mr. Monteiro stated that it is a testament to the hard work of the staff of the Elizabeth Board of Education, not just the teachers but everyone security, food service, secretaries, nurses all the way to the superintendent. Mr. Monteiro stated that it is the sum of all the parts that makes this district successful. Mr. Monteiro stated that he understands Mr. Trujillo's anger and appreciates Ms. Bathelus to bring us both together. Mr. Monteiro stated that it has been a mission to unite Elizabeth and can you imagine the possibilities of a united Board of Education along with the City of Elizabeth administration working together. Mr. Monteiro stated that we are now the Number One Urban School District in the State of New Jersey. Mr. Monteiro stated that he believes that Newark, Jersey City, and Paterson have been taken over by the State and just this week the Governor announced that they are taking over the school system of Camden. Mr. Monteiro stated that here we are this remarkable school district and asked where is the recognition and the praise that should be bestowed upon all the hard work that is taking place here in the district. Mr. Monteiro stated that we are not here for the glory and we are not here for the praise we are here for the children of the City and clearly for the taxpayers. Mr. Monteiro stated that the chart clearly defines what this school district has done and what it is going to continue to do. Mr. Monteiro stated that we have taken our Board of Education meetings throughout the City and now to set up town meetings throughout the City of Elizabeth to explain the budget to people and to understand the stark contrast between what is going on in City Hall and what is going on here in the Board of Education. Mr. Monteiro stated that he would be more than happy to sit at a table with the Mayor and to compare our budgets and have an open public forum like we have here and challenged the Mayor to do that and that is where the healing will

begin rather than pointing fingers and casting blame and creating all this confusion and to stop the nonsense and let's do what is right for the children of the City and the taxpayers of Elizabeth.

The motion was carried by the following vote:

Affirmative: Mrs. Castillo-Ospina, Messrs. Donoso, González, Perreira, Trujillo, Monteiro – 6

Negative: Ms. Bathelus – 1

Mr. Monteiro presented the following public participation statement.

“At this time, the microphones are open for those wishing to speak for or against the budget who have signed in prior to this session. I shall call individuals to the microphone based on the order of the sign-in. Each statement made by a participant shall be limited to three minutes in duration. The total time of public comment shall be limited to 60 minutes. No individual is able to yield their time to another individual. All statements shall be directed to the presiding officer; no participant may address or question Board Members individually. The following rules for public participation shall apply:

1. Time limits will be strictly enforced;
2. No personal attacks on individuals;
3. No vulgar or indecent language;
4. A person may address the Board no more than once during a single meeting;
5. Speakers should refrain from naming individuals;
6. Comments or questions posed during public participation will not be debated.

As a reminder this is not a debate nor an audit but an opportunity for citizens to present objections and to be heard with respect to the budget.”

Mr. Monteiro called twice upon the first public participant, Maria Echavarria, to address the Board. Mrs. Echavarria did not come forward.

Since there were no other citizens that signed in to address the Board, Mr. Monteiro declared this portion of the public meeting closed.

Mr. Trujillo stated that there are several reasons taxes go up and one of them that the taxpayers should be especially concerned about is the corruption in government. Mr. Trujillo stated that just this week the Attorney General indicted Birdsall Engineering for making over \$686,000. in illegal campaign contributions. Mr. Trujillo stated that Birdsall Engineering has several contracts with the City of Elizabeth and they do work in the City of Elizabeth. Mr. Trujillo stated that they funneled money to campaigns in different towns and gave an example of how it works funneling the money through their employees and financing the campaign of a mayor or state senator and they are going to give the better contract not to the guy who deserves it but to the one who gave the most money. Mr. Trujillo asked who pays for that and do you think they pay out of their own pocket and then they fleece the taxpayers. Mr. Trujillo stated that this money has ended up in the coffers of Mayor Chris Bollwage of this City and State Senator Lesniak who represents this district. Mr. Trujillo stated that other municipalities throughout the State have bans on pay-to-play and this City does not.

Mr. Trujillo stated that we should write to City Council to encourage them to adopt a policy to ban pay-to-play in the City of Elizabeth. Mr. Trujillo challenged Senator Lesniak and Mayor Bollwage and all those members of City Council who have received in the past any money from these people then they should be returning that money. Mr. Trujillo stated that they want to judge this Board of Education and hold us to a higher standard while they are selling our City to

the highest bidder. Mr. Trujillo stated that when you are paying your friends this is what causes the tax increases to go up. Mr. Trujillo stated that this has come to light and now that this is an indictment the taxpayers are going to be a lot better off knowing this is going to halt. Mr. Trujillo paraphrased the attorney from Birdsall who commented that they found it unfortunate that the Attorney General took this action now because over the last ten months they had gotten rid of some of the people who had done this. Mr. Trujillo stated that they sit there and judge us the Elizabeth Board of Education who just gave you a budget that is fiscally responsible meanwhile the Mayor goes on twitter and attacks the Board President and lies that we are going to increase taxes \$200. to \$400. Mr. Trujillo stated that he remembers when he sent out the letter the last time and mailed out to everyone telling them that it was going to be a \$400. increase to everyone using scare tactics and lies meanwhile they are stealing our tax dollars and pointing in the other direction.

Mr. Monteiro stated that as a point of clarity the Elizabeth Board of Education does have a pay-to-play policy and that means any vendor or company that does business with the school board is limited to how much they are allowed to contribute to the campaign of anyone that would be running for office. Mr. Monteiro stated that pay-to-play has been adopted throughout the State of New Jersey and most of the large cities and that the City of Elizabeth is one of the few that have not adopted pay-to-play. Mr. Monteiro stated that pay-to-play cap is \$300. per company and when you do not have a pay to play ordinance the number is obscene and can go in the thousands and that is what has been happening in cities throughout New Jersey for years. Mr. Monteiro stated that Birdsall is a very large engineering company that does business throughout the State of New Jersey in many municipalities and were contributing hundreds of thousands of dollars to many elected officials throughout the State and here in Union County they show up heavily in Senator Lesniak's campaign reports and Mayor Bollwage's campaign reports and some of the City Councilmember's reports because they do not have the pay-to-play ordinance. Mr. Monteiro stated that for years it has been asked of City Council to adopt a ban on pay-to-play and when he was a City Councilman he tried several times to move the pay-to-play ordinance to no avail and it was shot down. Mr. Monteiro stated that as Ms. Bathelus mentioned these are new times and maybe the new Councilmembers with the support of the people at home to help and call the Council member of each ward and encourage them to move and support an ordinance for pay-to-play and you would see your property taxes lowered. Mr. Monteiro agreed with Mr. Trujillo and suggested that we get an ordinance from our neighboring city and then we can have something to vote on and send to City Council. Mr. Monteiro requested that Mr. Kennedy obtain an ordinance from Jersey City.

On a motion was made by Mr. Donoso, seconded by Mr. Trujillo, the meeting was adjourned at 10:00 p.m.

The motion was carried by the following vote:

Affirmative: Ms. Bathelus, Mrs. Castillo-Ospina, Messrs. Donoso, González, Perreira, Trujillo, Monteiro – 7

Negative: None

Harold E. Kennedy, Jr.
School Business Administrator/Board Secretary